



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

enterprise, as the journal preserves the record of the toils and hardships encountered by the pioneers in this undertaking, and of the unfortunate issue of the adventure.

[Several manuscript documents relating to the "Castorland" settlement are contained in the New-York State Library. See Catalogue of MSS. in New-York State Library, p. 97. For a full account of the proceedings of the company, see Hough's "History of Lewis County," pp. 34-70, 104-108; and "History of Jefferson County," pp. 46-55.]

MARCH MEETING.

The Society held a stated monthly meeting this day, Thursday, March 10; the President in the chair.

Donations were announced from the Royal Academy of Sciences of Lisbon; the Chicago Historical Society; the Essex Institute; the New-England Loyal Publication Society; the Suffolk Institute of Archæology and Natural History; John Appleton, M.D.; Hamilton Hill, Esq.; Benjamin P. Johnson, Esq.; Hon. James H. Lane; Mr. S. H. Smothers; John Tappan, Esq.; George W. Thacher, Esq.; William Winthrop, Esq.; the publishers of the "Round Table;" and from Messrs. Lincoln (S.), Robbins (C.), Sibley, Washburn, Webb, and Winthrop, of the Society.

A communication was received from the Corresponding Secretary, stating that, on account of his feeble health, he was unable any longer to discharge his duties to the Society, and declining to be a candidate for re-election at the annual meeting.

The President announced the recent arrival from Malta of several boxes containing a donation of valuable books from William Winthrop, Esq., United-States consul at that place.

Voted, That the President be requested to communicate to Mr. Winthrop the cordial thanks of the Society for his large and repeated benefactions.

The President presented a large number of ancient broadsides and other printed documents found among the Winthrop Papers. It having been suggested by one of the members that a catalogue of Harvard College of the year 1700 (the only one of that date known to be in existence), noticed by him among these printed papers, might with propriety, with the President's consent, be presented by the Society to Harvard College, it was, after some conversation, *voted*, That the whole collection be referred to a Committee, consisting of Messrs. Ellis, Deane, and Livermore, to examine and report as to the disposition of the whole or any portion of the same.

Mr. TICKNOR read a note addressed to him by Francis S. Hoffman, Esq., of New York, offering to the acceptance of the Society two impressions, in pure tin, of a medal in memory of Washington Irving: whereupon the following vote, offered by Mr. Ticknor, was unanimously passed:—

Voted, That the thanks of the Society be given to Francis S. Hoffman, Esq., of the city of New York, for his gift, this day received, of a copy of the beautiful medal which he has caused to be struck in memory of the late Washington Irving,—an appropriate and graceful tribute to one whose genius, at once so brilliant and so gentle, has done honor to his country, and to the age in which he lived.

Mr. Ticknor in a few words gracefully acknowledged the manner in which the Society had received his “Life

of Prescott," which he had prepared in the place of the Memoir assigned to him by the Society; and spoke with great feeling of his still deepening impression of the estimable and admirable traits of Mr. Prescott's character, which he had endeavored to delineate with simple truthfulness.

The President presented a *fac-simile* of the Emancipation Proclamation by the President of the United States; also two beautiful portraits of General Washington and Mrs. Washington, reduced copies from Stuart's portraits.

A communication from Mr. Whitmore relating to the authorship of a paper entitled "Reasons to be considered for justifying the Undertakers of the intended Plantation in New England," &c., was referred to the Committee on publishing the Proceedings.

HON. ROBERT C. WINTHROP.

DEAR SIR, — The publication, in your interesting "Life of John Winthrop," of a paper entitled "Reasons to be considered for justifying the Undertakers of the intended Plantation in New England," &c., has naturally caused a comparison between it and a similar paper commonly ascribed to Rev. Francis Higginson. In editing a reprint of the "Hutchinson Papers," I have been obliged to examine both documents closely; and I desire to present certain facts which lead me to consider your copy the original, and your distinguished ancestor the author.

You are aware that the only authority for Higginson's claim is the fact that Hutchinson prints it with the Agreement, and the Journal of his voyage written by Higginson. A slight claim is also made in favor of the Rev. John White, of Dorchester; but this, I presume, will be easily dismissed. When we consider the two copies, we see at once that Governor Winthrop's is more comprehensive and better arranged. It contains all that Higginson has, and has more system in its plan. When we descend to a minute criticism of particular words and phrases, we find that Winthrop has preserved the original.

It would be impossible to expand Higginson's phrases into his, but extremely easy to abbreviate these into Higginson's.

Thus, taking the first eight "general considerations:" in the first,

WINTHROP WRITES:

"The Jesuits labour to rear up in those parts."

¶ 2

"All other churches of Europe are brought to destruction; and our sins, for which the Lord begins already to frown upon us, do threaten evil times to be coming upon us."

¶ 3

"This land grows weary of her inhabitants; so as man, who is the most precious of all creatures, is here more vile and base than the earth *we* tread upon, and of less price than a horse or a sheep. Masters are forced by authority to entertain servants, parents to maintain their own children: all towns complain of the burthen of their poor, though we have taken up many unnecessary, yea, unlawful trades to maintain them; and we use the authority of the law to hinder the increase of our people, as by urging the statute against cottages and inmates. And thus it is come to pass, that children, servants, and neighbors, especially if they be poor, are counted the greatest burthens, which, if things were right, would be the chiefest earthly blessings."

It is easily seen that Winthrop gives the reason why children, &c., are counted burdens; while Higginson, in omitting them, makes his two sentences without any dependence on each other.

WINTHROP.

¶ 5

"We are grown to that height of intemperance in all excess of riot, as no man's estate almost will suffice to keep sail with his equals."

HIGGINSON WRITES:

"To rear up in all places of the world."

"All other churches of Europe are brought to destruction; and it may be justly feared that the like judgment is coming upon us."

"The land grows weary of her inhabitants; so that man, which is the most precious of all creatures, is here more vile and base than the earth *they* tread upon: so as children, neighbours, and friends, especially of the poor, are counted the greatest burdens, which, if things were right, would be the chiefest earthly blessings."

HIGGINSON.

4

"We are grown to that excess and intemperance in all excess of riot, as no *mean* estate almost will suffice [a man] to keep sail with his equals."

Here Higginson is so obscure, that a word has to be supplied to make sense; but Winthrop, by writing "man's" for "mean," makes the sentence clear.

WINTHROP.

¶ 6

"The *fountains* of learning and religion are so corrupted, as (beside the unsupportable charge of their education) most children (even the *best wits* and of fairest hopes) are perverted, corrupted, and utterly overthrown, by the multitude of evil examples and the licentious *government* of those seminaries, where men strain at gnats and swallow camels, use all severity for maintenance of caps and other accomplishments, but suffer all ruffian-like fashions and disorder in manners to pass uncontrolled."

Here Winthrop's "corrupted fountains" is better than the "corrupted schools" of Higginson. His "best wits" means the most intelligent; and I doubt if "wittiest" was a word used in 1629. So Winthrop mentions the "licentious *government*" of the schools, censuring a general laxity of rule; but Higginson's "licentious governors" points to personal guilt on the part of the rulers.

Again: Winthrop, from his family connections, might be particular in censuring a lack of discipline in the universities; but why should Higginson be familiar with the details after leaving his college?

WINTHROP.

¶ 8

"If any . . . join the church, . . . it will be an example of great use both for removing the *scandal of worldly and sinister respects* which is cast upon the adventurers, to give more life to the faith of God's people in their prayers for the plantation, and to encourage others to join the more willingly in it."

Here the change of a word by Winthrop makes all clear. He wishes to remove the scandal of improper motives which do not exist: Higginson wishes to remove the scandal and the improper motives which do not exist. The criticisms may seem trivial; but where we find the one author, Winthrop, writes always clearly, the other makes confused and erroneous statements. It is evident, then, that Winthrop's text is more correct than Higginson's.

When we proceed to the Objections and Answers, Winthrop's copy is more copious and better arranged. It will not be necessary to

HIGGINSON.

5

"The *schools* of learning and religion are so corrupted, as (beside the unsupportable charge of their education) most children, even the *best, wittiest*, and of fairest hopes, are perverted, corrupted, and utterly overthrown, by the multitude of evil examples and licentious *governors* of those seminaries."

HIGGINSON.

8

"If any, &c., it will be an example of great use both for the removal of *scandal and sinister* and worldly respects, to give more life, &c."

dissect and contrast the two versions. I will only cite the first in Winthrop, and the fifth in Higginson's arrangement. The objection is, that they had no warrant to enter into the land possessed by others. Winthrop answers, "That which lies common, and hath never been replenished or subdued, is free to any that *possess and improve* it." He argues that man only has a right to what he can occupy and improve. As to the Indians, "So as, if we leave them sufficient for their use, we may lawfully take the rest; there being more than enough for them and us." Higginson abbreviates, "That which is common to all is proper to none." He then copies the examples of the different kinds of right to property, and adds, "Secondly, there is more than enough for them and us." Now, the two ideas are different; Winthrop carefully reserving the right to a portion to the Indians, Higginson denying all claims by them. The passage is too long to copy; but the reader will find the examples drawn from the Scriptures are a part of Winthrop's argument, but have nothing to do with Higginson's trenchant axioms. I think we may safely conclude that Higginson had but an abbreviated copy of the original paper: indeed, it seems as if his copy were written out from short-hand notes, which would account for the transposition of sentences, and the numerous verbal errors. It must be remembered that the only evidence to support Higginson's claim must be found in the superior purity of his text; and this, I think, must be abandoned.

We then agree that the correct reading is to be found in a manuscript written by Forth Winthrop, who was his father's copyist; that Winthrop was preparing numerous documents of a similar nature at the same time; that the internal evidence (as in the reference to the universities) is in his favor.

One other criticism may be offered. The "general considerations" in seven paragraphs recite that England was no longer a place for the devout; that colonizing was a duty; that the land was ready, and that a company ought to join forces with the Church. The eighth proposition was, that it would be an example of great use if those who were known to be godly, and to live in wealth and prosperity, should so join the Church, and go to New England. We know that Winthrop was the chief of the persons here indicated, and that he responded to this call. I cannot reject the impression, that the man who accepted this position was the man to write this solemn appeal. It would almost seem as if the propositions, as we read them, were the several stages of a debate held at Isaac Johnson's house; and that,

after the eighth, there was but one step to take, — the signing of the Agreement at Cambridge.

Until light shall come to us from some other source, I think we must hold that John Winthrop, who has faithfully reported the “causes” of the settlement of New England, was the man who gave these considerations their form.

Yours very truly,

W. H. WHITMORE.

A letter was read from A. L. Rawson, Esq., of Syracuse, N. Y., offering for the Society’s cabinet a sword purporting to have been carried by Colonel John Brooks in the war of the Revolution. The sword was referred for examination to Mr. Charles Brooks.

A donation of two photographs of the “Aspinwall Elm,” from Samuel Masury, was communicated by the Librarian, who was directed to present the thanks of the Society to the donor.

The President exhibited, partly for the sake of the autograph signatures attached to it, an order of the Privy Council to investigate the charges of William Morton, of New London, against John Tinker and others. The order was found among the Winthrop Papers. The occasion of this order is explained in the following statement, furnished by Dr. Appleton, our Assistant Librarian: —

The document here submitted, dated 14th September, 1664, is addressed to the Commissioners for New England, — Colonel Nicolls, Sir Robert Carr, Colonel George Cartwright, and Samuel Maverick. It bears the seal of the Privy Council, and the signatures of Edward Hyde, Earl of Clarendon; John, Earl (afterwards Duke) of Lauderdale, Secretary of State for Scotland; John, Earl of Middleton, Commissioner for Scotland; Humphry Henchman, Bishop of London, who succeeded Juxon,

on the translation of the latter to the archiepiscopal see of Canterbury; John, Lord Berkeley, of Stratton; Sir William Morice, one of the principal Secretaries of State; Sir Edward Nicholas, Secretary of State; Sir Thomas Ingram, Chancellor of the Duchy of Lancaster; and John Nicholas, probably Secretary of the Council.

The order requires the Commissioners to examine the complaints in the petition of William Morton; and, if they appear to be well founded, that the guilty persons "be proceeded against according to Justice, for vindication of his Majestie's Honour; and also to take particular Care for the Releife and Reparation of the Petitioner's great Sufferings, as an Encouragement of his Loyalty and good Affections to his Majestie's Service."

William Morton, a native of London, and one of the early settlers of New London, where he was constable in 1662, brought an accusation against John Tinker, an assistant and first magistrate, charging him with treason: whereupon Mr. Tinker commenced an action against Morton and two others for defamation, and a fine was imposed on the defendants by the "Particular Court."

Miss Caulkins, in her "History of New London," gives a curious protest issued by Morton, wherein he styles himself "a free denison of that most famous country of England," and proceeds with his charge against Tinker, "who," he says, "is lookt at as one that should exsicute Justice, and sworne by oath soe to doe, espetially to studdie the honour of our Royall King and of his life and happie being; yet, notwithstanding, the saide Tinker, although it was notoriously knowne unto him that some had spoken Treason against the King in a high degree, . . . flung away the Testimony: wherefore, in the name of his Maiesty, whose deputy I am, I doe protest against the said Tinker, that he has concealed treason against the King, contrary to the Laws of England; & so, as I conceive, has brought himselfe under treason."

Morton was ordered to give bond in £500 to appear and answer the suit of Mr. Tinker in May, 1663; but, in October of the same year, the plaintiff died, and was honored with a funeral at the public charge. The case was referred by the General Court in October, 1665, to the Governor (Winthrop), the Deputy-Governor (Mason), Mr. Leete, Mr. Chapman, and Matthew Griswold, or any four of them, "to heare and issue," and to make report in May following; Morton consenting to this disposition of the affair. He died in comparative obscurity and poverty, probably in 1668.

The order of the Privy Council is here printed.

To Our very loving Friends the Commissioners for New England, or any Two of them.

After Our hearty Commendations. Wee here enclosed send you the Petition of William Morton of the Towne of New London, in the Colony of Connectecutte in New England, wherein he complayneth of Crimes of a high Nature committed against his Ma^{ties}: by seuerall Persons there, and of the Injustice done to himself and others for endeavouring to proceed against them according to their Duty and Allegiance. Which Wee hauing taken into Consideration, Haue thought fitt, and do accordingly hereby pray and require you fully to examine the Complaints in the Petition mentioned; and if they appeare true by credible and sufficient Testimony, that you cause such of those persons who shall be found guilty, to be proceeded against according to Justice for vindication of his Ma^{ties}: Honour; and also to take particular Care for the Releife and Reparation of the Pet^r: great Sufferings, as an Encouragement of his Loyalty and good Affections to his Ma^{ties}: Service. And so not doubting of your ready Obedience to these Our Commands, Wee bid you heartily Farewell.

From the Court at Whitehall, the 14th day of September, 1664.

Your very loving Friends,

CLARENDON C.

LAUDERDAILL.

MIDDLETON.

HUMFR: LONDON.

JO. BERKELEY.

WILL. MORICE.

EDW: NICHOLAS.

THO: INGRAM.

JOHN NICHOLAS.

Lre to the Com^{rs} of New England.

The Simile of Signatures of Privy Counsellors, 1664

Charles II

Thomson

James Thomson

James Thomson

James Thomson

James Thomson

James Thomson

James Thomson

The President nominated, as a Committee to examine the Treasurer's accounts, Messrs. Lawrence, Russell, and F. E. Parker.

The President also appointed, with the consent of the Society, as a Committee to nominate officers for the ensuing year, Messrs. Washburn, S. Lincoln, and Livermore.

ANNUAL MEETING, APRIL 14, 1864.

The Society held its annual meeting this day, Thursday, April 14, at eleven o'clock, A.M.; the President, Hon. ROBERT C. WINTHROP, in the chair.

Donations were announced from the Commonwealth of Massachusetts; the State of Rhode Island; the Literary and Historical Society of Quebec; the New-England Loyal Publication Society; the Bishop Seabury Mission; the Trustees of Bowdoin College; the Young Men's Association of Cincinnati; the Vestry of Christ's Church, Longwood; Hon. Ira M. Barton; Mr. W. L. Bradley; Henry B. Dawson, Esq.; Rev. B. F. De Costa; Thomas Gaffield, Esq.; Thomas S. Kirkbride, M.D.; Henry T. Parker, Esq.; Benjamin S. Shaw, M.D.; Rev. Edwin M. Stone; Rev. Frederic A. Whitney; William Winthrop, Esq.; and from Messrs. Lamson, Loring, Robbins (C.), Webb, and Winthrop, of the Society.